



**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
EMAIL [info@mtc.ca.gov](mailto:info@mtc.ca.gov)  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

*Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Alicia C. Aguirre*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*David Campos*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Dave Cortese*  
Santa Clara County

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacomini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Scott Haggerty*  
Alameda County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sam Liccardo*  
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

*Mark Luce*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Joe Pirzynski*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Jean Quan*  
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Scott Wiener*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

**MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE**  
**April 12, 2013**  
**MINUTES**

**ATTENDANCE**

Chair Sperring called the MTC Planning Committee meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Planning Committee members in attendance were: Commissioners Azumbrado, Giacomini, Haggerty, Halsted, Luce, and Mackenzie. Commission Chair Rein-Worth and Commission Vice-Chair Cortese were present in their ex-officio capacity. Commissioners' Bates, Campos, Quan, Tissier and Weiner were also in attendance.

ABAG Administrative Committee members in attendance were: Cortese, Gioia, Haggerty, Luce, Mar, Pierce, and Sperring.

**CONSENT CALENDAR: a) Minutes of March 8, 2013**

Commissioner Halsted moved approval of the Consent Calendar, Commissioner Mackenzie seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

AGAG Administrative Committee member Cortese moved approval of the Consent Calendar, Mayor Pierce seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

**DRAFT PLAN BAY AREA**

Ms. Miriam Chion, ABAG, updated the committee on the Draft Plan Bay Area development pattern, including the distribution of employment, population, and housing as well as growth strategies. Mr. Ken Kirkey, MTC, updated the committee on the Draft Plan Bay Area investment strategy, including an overview of committed, discretionary, and total transportation funding and related policies, as well as performance results. He also described the plan's advocacy platform.

In closing, Mr. Kirkey stated that the comment period for the Draft Plan and the Draft Environmental Impact Report closes on May 16, 2013. He noted that there are a number of ways people can submit comments in addition to public hearings and open houses in each county. Staff will come back to the committee in June with a summary of the comments, and will be looking to propose a Final Plan and Final EIR for Commission adoption in July 2013.

Commissioner Sperring noted that public comment would be taken after the staff presentation on the Draft Environmental Impact Report.

**DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (DEIR)**

Ms. Carolyn Clevenger, MTC, presented an overview of the DEIR, which was released on April 2, 2013 for public review and comment. Comments on the DEIR can be made at both the Plan Bay Area Public Hearings and the EIR Public Hearings, submitted online, emailed, or mailed. She stated that deliberation and decision making on the final EIR by ABAG and MTC will commence following the close of the public comment period. All comments received and responses to comments will be entered into the record for the final EIR. The MTC Commission and ABAG Executive Board are scheduled to adopt the Final EIR in July 2013.

Public Comment:

- Stephanie Reyes, Greenbelt Alliance, stated that the Plan is headed in a good direction and that she was happy to see that it will protect open space and natural lands in the future and also provide more choices relative to places to live and get around. She urged staff to include two key elements in the Final Plan: 1) plan for affordable homes in all communities with access to jobs, transit, and opportunity, and 2) increase funds for transit operations.
- Linda Best, Contra Costa Council, commented on the various EIR alternatives and urged the committee to keep the higher numbers of housing and jobs in the final Plan. She also commented that the PDA Feasibility Assessment should be an integral part of the deliberations to arrive at the Final Plan. She expressed support for the advocacy platform recommendations with respect to the policy reforms. Paul Campos, Building Industry Association of the Bay Area (BIA), expressed his support for a sustainable communities strategy that maximizes the region's jobs potential and economic development, and stated that housing is the key. He urged the committee to include the higher housing figure which was identified earlier in the planning process as a minimum needed to get to 1.2 million new jobs.
- Bob Allen, Urban Habitat, supported Stephanie Reyes' comments, and stated that increased funding for transit operations was key. He noted the importance of mapping out the future discussions about the trade-off among the elements of each EIR alternative.
- Catherine Lyons, Bay Area Council, supported the higher housing number and the advocacy agenda that includes taking a look at modernizing CEQA as well as looking at replacement of redevelopment funding and other policy initiatives to get to a higher rate of success within PDAs.
- Sandi Galvez, Bay Area Regional Housing Industry (BARHI), urged the committee to address the inequities that the region's residents are experiencing. She stated that if the Plan is going to reduce the 10-year average difference in life expectancy between more affluent residents and less affluent residents, then it will need to provide greater opportunities for everyone regardless of socioeconomic status or ethnic background to have access to quality neighborhoods, housing, and neighborhood services. She noted that an increase in access to transportation choices and affordable housing choices will have tremendous differences in health outcomes.

Committee comment:

- Commissioner Sperring asked for clarification on differences between the Department of Finance (DOF) and ABAG forecasts. Ms. Chion stated that the DOF projection focuses

on fertility rates and mortality rates. It does not take into account economic trends except through migration, and the migration rates that were used were based on 2000-2010 which is the period that the Bay Area experienced economic decline on two major recessions. She noted that ABAG's projections take into account the Bay Area's employment trends which the DOF Forecast did not.

- Commissioner Spring suggested that staff create a chart that gives a definition of the investment that goes into a PDA.
- ABAG Committee member Mar stated that the proposed Plan has much higher percentage of potential displacement than under the EEJ or No Project alternative. He asked staff for clarification. Mr. Ezra Rapport, ABAG, stated that cities that nominated the PDAs want to improve those areas. By putting more investment in these areas, some of which are communities of concern, it is more likely that residents will break the cycle of poverty, and neighborhoods will improve. He stated that more affordable housing will need to go into key PDAs that are also Communities of Concern and that's not captured in this statistic.
- Mayor Pierce requested that the PowerPoint presentation be posted where they can download it and forward it to their constituents, because the plan has gotten so much press and so much attention, that some people think all of the investment money that MTC has is going into the plan, and they don't understand that while the discretionary money is under discussion the committed money is still there.
- Commissioner Weiner asked how the Commission connects funding decisions with housing development near transit. Mr. Heminger stated that MTC's TOD Policy requires that corridors related to any transit expansion are planned with established minimum density requirements along the corridor.
- Commissioner Tissier stated that the presentation is very helpful and suggested adding a slide into the presentation that highlights how much other money is going directly to the local community. She supported making the presentation more widely available to the public.
- Commissioner Rein-Worth stated that when members of the public hear more and more about the plan, about the elements of regional planning, along with local control, local decision-making, they're really reassured about what this plan represents and the opportunities it provides.
- Commissioner Luce stated that CEQA is a huge impediment to making progress, and if we don't make some changes in how projects are reviewed and approved, the Plan isn't going to mean a whole lot. He suggested replacing CEQA with a sustainability act, something considers the environment, but also takes into account the economy, and social equity.
- Commissioner Mackenzie stated that in terms of CEQA, over the last six years in the city of Rohnert Park they have entitled 4,000 housing units in three specific plan areas, and one master planned area. Not one of these houses has been built. He would put forward the concept that the reason that these houses were not built was not because of CEQA, it was because of the state of the economy.
- Commissioner Haggerty asked staff how to get more money towards the priority conservation areas. Mr. Heminger stated that the PDA approach is designed to try to keep the Bay Area within the existing urban footprint, so we need to invest more directly in the

PCA side of the coin, but it's also true that if we pull off the strategy with PDAs, we're going to do a lot for the PCAs indirectly as well.

- Commissioner Haggerty also commented on the issue of local land, or local land use control, and asked if there could be a disclaimer somewhere in the Plan that basically says the City of Livermore wants to build something, they can certainly do that. Mr. Heminger stated that the disclaimer exists in state law. There are several places in the law that says this does not interfere with local land use decisions, and there is no problem quoting the law in the plan.
- Commissioner Bates expressed his concern that low-income people increasingly do not have the opportunity to live in the Bay Region.
- Commissioner Campos asked staff what can be done to make sure that the Plan incorporates as much as possible from the EEJ scenario to deal with the issue of potential displacement. Mr. Heminger stated that the advice from the Policy Advisory Council was to look at the inputs to the Draft Plan and EIR Alternatives including the location of the affordable housing and the mitigation of displacement pressure.
- Commissioner Quan requested a presentation be made at Oakland City Hall. She also supported the issue of looking at the housing issue, and supported the comments about making funding decisions more transparent. Lastly, she requested that staff brief her on the equity-related issues.
- Commissioner Cortese stated that he still has some concerns about general outreach to professionals, neighborhood associations, etc. which can be done effectively through e-mails and web links.
- Supervisor Gioia stated that if they choose different elements from one alternative to add the project alternative, the EIR analysis is sufficient to allow them to do that. Ms. Tina Thomas, Thomas Law, responded that staff would need to run the model and make sure that with that adjustment they're still achieving the GHG and housing targets.

#### **OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT**

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 11:26 a.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, May 10, 2013 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.

*j:\committe\planning committee\2013\May\4\_final minutes.doc*